Balloon Hashing

A Memory-Hard Function with Provable Protection Against Sequential Attacks

Dan Boneh, Stanford * Henry Corrigan-Gibbs, Stanford Stuart Schechter, Microsoft Research

Balloon Hashing

A new password hashing function that:

- 1. Is proven memory-hard (in the sequential setting)
- 2. Uses a password-independent data access pattern
- 3. Matches the performance of the best heuristically secure memory-hard functions

The Attacker's Job

The Attacker's Job

A good password hashing function makes the attacker's job as difficult as possible.

A good password hashing function makes the attacker's job as difficult as possible.

A good password hashing function makes the attacker's job as difficult as possible.

If the authentication server can compute… **X hashes** per **\$ of energy** then an attacker *with custom hardware* should only be able to compute… **(1+ε)X hashes** per **\$ of energy**

A good password hashing function makes the attacker's job as difficult as possible.

If the authentication server can compute… **X hashes** per **\$ of energy** then an attacker *with custom hardware* should only be able to compute…

(1+ε)X hashes per **\$ of energy**

By this metric, conventional hash functions (e.g., SHA-256) are far from optimal!

Intel Ivy Bridge-E Core i7-4960X http://kylebennett.com/files/hfpics/IVB-E_%28LCC%29_Die_Wafer_Shot-7837.jpg

Intel Ivy Bridge-E Core i7-4960X http://kylebennett.com/files/hfpics/IVB-E_%28LCC%29_Die_Wafer_Shot-7837.jpg

Intel Ivy Bridge-E Core i7-4960X http://kylebennett.com/files/hfpics/IVB-E_%28LCC%29_Die_Wafer_Shot-7837.jpg

Intel Ivy Bridge-E Core i7-4960X [http://kylebennett.com/files/hfpics/IVB-E_%28LCC%29_Die_Wafer_Shot-7837.jpg](http://kylebennett.com/files/hfpics/IVB-E_(LCC)_Die_Wafer_Shot-7837.jpg)

Intel Ivy Bridge-E Core i7-4960X [http://kylebennett.com/files/hfpics/IVB-E_%28LCC%29_Die_Wafer_Shot-7837.jpg](http://kylebennett.com/files/hfpics/IVB-E_(LCC)_Die_Wafer_Shot-7837.jpg)

rđ ά¥ ά¥ 江岸 F T F 愅 手 Ŧ 手 厝 F G W F. R. F k ¥ F i. ł F r dik F ł F Ŧ F i i k Y $\frac{1}{2}$ ŧ Ŧ 'n r dik ł ł H. k i. l. ¥ Ŧ r file r file rit k r fri F 菲 **FILLE** 蓶 F 腪 14.19 古库 手 手 手 手

$Cost \approx Area$

1000000x efficiency gain!

Memory-Hardness

-
-
- -
	-
	-
-
-

Memory-Hardness

Memory-hard functions use a large amount of working space during their computation

- \rightarrow Attacker must keep caches on chip
- → Decreases the advantage of special-purpose HW

[Reinhold 1999], [Dwork, Goldberg, Naor 2003], [Abadi et al. 2005], [Percival 2009]

Memory-Hardness

Memory-hard functions use a large amount of working space during their computation

- \rightarrow Attacker must keep caches on chip
- \rightarrow Decreases the advantage of special-purpose HW

[Reinhold 1999], [Dwork, Goldberg, Naor 2003], [Abadi et al. 2005], [Percival 2009]

Typical technique:

- 1. **Fill** fill buffer with pseudo-random bytes
- 2. **Mix** read and write pseudo-random blocks in buffer
- 3. **Extract** extract function output from buffer contents

Without memory-hardness

Without memory-hardness

With memory-hardness
- I. Background on password hashing
- II. Goals
- III. The Balloon algorithm
- IV. Discussion

- **I. Background on password hashing**
- II. Goals
- III. The Balloon algorithm
- IV. Discussion

- I. Background on password hashing
- **II. Goals**
- III. The Balloon algorithm
- IV. Discussion

Goal 1: Memory-Hardness

Memory-hard functions: [Abadi et al. 2005] [Percival 2009] Random oracles: [Bellare & Rogaway 1993]

Goal 1: Memory-Hardness

Informally, a memory-hard function, with hardness parameter N, requires space *S* and time *T* to compute, where

S · *T* ∈ Ω(N2)

in the random-oracle model.

Memory-hard functions: [Abadi et al. 2005] [Percival 2009] Random oracles: [Bellare & Rogaway 1993]

Goal 1: Memory-Hardness

Informally, a memory-hard function, with hardness parameter N, requires space *S* and time *T* to compute, where *S* · *T* ∈ Ω(N2)

in the random-oracle model.

Intuition: any adversary who tries to save space will pay a large penalty in computation time.

Memory-hard functions: [Abadi et al. 2005] [Percival 2009] Random oracles: [Bellare & Rogaway 1993]

• The memory access pattern should not leak information about the password being hashed [Tsunoo *et al.* 2003] [Bernstein 2005] [Bonneau & Mironov 2006] […]

• The memory access pattern should not leak information about the password being hashed [Tsunoo *et al.* 2003] [Bernstein 2005] [Bonneau & Mironov 2006] […]

Goal 3: Real-World Practical

• The memory access pattern should not leak information about the password being hashed [Tsunoo *et al.* 2003] [Bernstein 2005] [Bonneau & Mironov 2006] […]

Goal 3: Real-World Practical

• The hash should be able to support hundreds of logins per second while filling L2 cache (or more)

bcrypt, PBKDF2 [Provos & Mazières 1999], [Kaliski 2000] Not memory hard

bcrypt, PBKDF2 [Provos & Mazières 1999], [Kaliski 2000] Not memory hard

scrypt [Percival 2009] Password-dependent memory access pattern

bcrypt, PBKDF2 [Provos & Mazières 1999], [Kaliski 2000] Not memory hard

scrypt [Percival 2009] Password-dependent memory access pattern

Parallel-secure schemes May be impractical for realistic parameter sizes [Alwen & Serbinenko 2015] [Alwen, Blocki, Pietrzak 2016]

bcrypt, PBKDF2 [Provos & Mazières 1999], [Kaliski 2000] Not memory hard

scrypt [Percival 2009] Password-dependent memory access pattern

Parallel-secure schemes May be impractical for realistic parameter sizes [Alwen & Serbinenko 2015] [Alwen, Blocki, Pietrzak 2016]

Argon2i and Catena [Biryukov et al. 2015] [Forler et al. 2015] Lack formal security analysis

bcrypt, PBKDF2 [Provos & Mazières 1999], [Kaliski 2000] Not memory hard

scrypt [Percival 2009] Password-dependent memory access pattern

Parallel-secure schem May be impractical further

We demonstrate a [Alwen, Blocki, Pietrzak 2016] practical attack against Argon2i

Argon2i and Catena [Biryukov et al. 2015] [Forler et al. 2015] Lack formal security analysis

- I. Background on password hashing
- **II. Goals**
- III. The Balloon algorithm
- IV. Discussion

- I. Background on password hashing
- II. Goals

III. The Balloon algorithm

IV. Discussion

Balloon Hashing

A password hashing function that:

- 1. Is proven memory-hard (in the sequential setting)
- 2. Uses a password-independent data access pattern
- 3. Matches the performance of the best heuristically secure memory-hard functions

Balloon Hashing

A password hashing function that:

- 1. Is **proven** memory-hard (in the sequential setting)
- 2. Uses a password-independent data access pattern
- 3. Matches the performance of the best heuristically secure memory-hard functions

Balloon(password, salt, $N = space_cost$, $R = num_rounds$): δ \leftarrow 3 // A security parameter. var $B_1, ..., B_N$ // A buffer of N blocks.

```
// Step 1: Fill Buffer
B_1 \leftarrow Hash(password, salt)
for i = 2, ..., N:
    B_i ← Hash(B_{i-1})
```
// Step 2: Mix Buffer for $r = 1, ..., R$: for $i = 1, ..., N$: // Chosen pseudorandomly from salt $(v_1, ..., v_{\delta}) \leftarrow$ Hash(salt, r, i) $\in Z_{N}^{\delta}$ B_i ← Hash(B_(i-1 mod N), B_i, B_{v₁, ..., B_{v_{δ})}}

// Step 3: Extract return B_N

Balloon(password, salt, $N = space_cost$, $R = num_rounds$): δ \leftarrow 3 // A security parameter. var $B_1, ..., B_N$ // A buffer of N blocks.

// Step 1: Fill Buffer $B_1 \leftarrow$ Hash(password, salt) for $i = 2, ..., N$: B_i ← $Hash(B_{i+1})$

// Step 2: Mix Buffer for $r = 1, ..., R$: for $i = 1, ..., N$: // Chosen pseudorandomly from salt $(v_1, ..., v_{\delta}) \leftarrow$ Hash(salt, r, i) $\in Z_{N}^{\delta}$ B_i ← Hash(B_(i-1 mod N), B_i, B_{v₁, ..., B_{v_{δ})}}

A conventional hash function (e.g., SHA-256)

// Step 3: Extract return B_N

Balloon(password, salt, $N = space_cost$, $R = num_rounds$): δ \leftarrow 3 // A security parameter. var $B_1, ..., B_N$ // A buffer of N blocks.

```
// Step 1: Fill Buffer
B_1 \leftarrow Hash(password, salt)
for i = 2, ..., N:
    B_i ← Hash(B_{i-1})
```
// Step 2: Mix Buffer for $r = 1, ..., R$: for $i = 1, ..., N$: // Chosen pseudorandomly from salt $(v_1, ..., v_{\delta}) \leftarrow$ Hash(salt, r, i) $\in Z_{N}^{\delta}$ B_i ← Hash(B_(i-1 mod N), B_i, B_{v₁, ..., B_{v_{δ})}}

// Step 3: Extract return B_N

-
-
-
-
-
- -

salt passwd

A "mode of operation" for a cryptographic hash function

A password hashing function that:

- 1. Is proven memory-hard (in the sequential setting)
- 2. Uses a password-independent data access pattern
- 3. Matches the performance of the best heuristically secure memory-hard functions

A password hashing function that:

- 1. Is proven memory-hard (in the sequential setting)
- 2. Uses a password-independent data access pattern ✓
	- 3. Matches the performance of the best heuristically secure memory-hard functions

A password hashing function that:

- 1. Is proven memory-hard (in the sequential setting)
- 2. Uses a password-independent data access pattern ✓
- Matches the performance of the best heuristically secure memory-hard functions ✓

A password hashing function the **The challenge**

1. Is proven memory-hard (in the sequential setting)

- 2. Uses a password-independent data access pattern ✓
- Matches the performance of the best heuristically secure memory-hard functions ✓

Theorem [informal]: Computing the N-block R-round Balloon function w.h.p., when δ=7, with space **S ≤ N/8** requires time **T** such that

 $S \cdot T \geq (2^R - 1)/8 \cdot N^2$.

Theorem [informal]: Computing the N-block R-round Balloon function w.h.p., when δ=7, with space **S ≤ N/8** requires time **T** such that

 $S \cdot T \geq (2^R - 1)/8 \cdot N^2$.

Saving a factor of 8 in space causes a slowdown **exponential** in # rounds

Theorem [informal]: Computing the N-block R-round Balloon function w.h.p., when δ=7, with space **S ≤ N/8** requires time **T** such that

 $S \cdot T \geq (2^R - 1)/8 \cdot N^2$.

When R=20, using 8× less space requires using **60,000**^{*∗*} more time

Theorem [informal]: Computing the N-block R-round Balloon function w.h.p., when δ=7, with space **S ≤ N/8** requires time **T** such that

 $S \cdot T \geq (2^R - 1)/8 \cdot N^2$.

Theorem [informal]: Computing the N-block R-round Balloon function w.h.p., when δ=7, with space **S ≤ N/8** requires time **T** such that

 $S \cdot T \geq (2^R - 1)/8 \cdot N^2$.

The proof works by inspecting the Balloon computation's datadependency graph.

We draw heavily on prior work on pebbling arguments

[Paterson & Hewitt 1970] [Paul & Tarjan 1978] [Dwork, Naor, Wee 2005] [Dziembowski, Kazana, Wichs 2011] [Alwen & Serbinenko 2015]

Using Balloon (δ=3). Both algorithms take four passes over memory.

Using Balloon (δ=3). Both algorithms take four passes over memory.

Using Balloon (δ=3). Both algorithms take four passes over memory.

Plan

- I. Background on password hashing
- II. Goals

III. The Balloon algorithm

IV. Discussion

Plan

- I. Background on password hashing
- II. Goals
- III. The Balloon algorithm
- **IV. Discussion**

-
-
- -
	-
	-
	-

• Alwen and Blocki (2016) show, in a *parallel* setting, it's possible to execute a space-saving attack against any memory-hard function w/ data-indep access pattern

• Alwen and Blocki (2016) show, in a *parallel* setting, it's possible to execute a space-saving attack against any memory-hard function w/ data-indep access pattern

— Including Balloon, Argon2i, etc.

- Alwen and Blocki (2016) show, in a *parallel* setting, it's possible to execute a space-saving attack against any memory-hard function w/ data-indep access pattern
	- Including Balloon, Argon2i, etc.
- The attack only applies when the memory usage is large enough $(> 1$ GB, but would only use \sim 16 MB in practice)

- Alwen and Blocki (2016) show, in a *parallel* setting, it's possible to execute a space-saving attack against any memory-hard function w/ data-indep access pattern
	- Including Balloon, Argon2i, etc.
- The attack only applies when the memory usage is large enough $(> 1$ GB, but would only use \sim 16 MB in practice)
- The attack would require special-purpose hardware with many cores and shared memory

- Alwen and Blocki (2016) show, in a *parallel* setting, it's possible to execute a space-saving attack against any memory-hard function w/ data-indep access pattern
	- Including Balloon, Argon2i, etc.
- The attack only applies when the memory usage is large enough $(> 1$ GB, but would only use \sim 16 MB in practice)
- The attack would require special-purpose hardware with many cores and shared memory
- \rightarrow Not yet clear whether these attacks are of practical concern.

-
-
-
-
-
-
-
-

Argon2: Winner of the recent Password Hashing Competition

Argon2: Winner of the recent Password Hashing Competition — Simple design, likely will see wide adoption

Argon2: Winner of the recent Password Hashing Competition

- Simple design, likely will see wide adoption
- No proof of memory-hardness (in any model)

Argon2: Winner of the recent Password Hashing Competition

- Simple design, likely will see wide adoption
- No proof of memory-hardness (in any model)
- $-$ Argon2i = variant with data-independent access pattern

Argon2: Winner of the recent Password Hashing Competition

- Simple design, likely will see wide adoption
- No proof of memory-hardness (in any model)
- $-$ Argon2i = variant with data-independent access pattern

Our Contributions

Argon2: Winner of the recent Password Hashing Competition

- Simple design, likely will see wide adoption
- No proof of memory-hardness (in any model)
- $-$ Argon2i = variant with data-independent access pattern

Our Contributions

• We demonstrate a practical attack against Argon2i's memoryhardness properties

(Designers have since modified the construction)

Argon2: Winner of the recent Password Hashing Competition

- Simple design, likely will see wide adoption
- No proof of memory-hardness (in any model)
- Argon2i = variant with data-independent access pattern

Our Contributions

• We demonstrate a practical attack against Argon2i's memoryhardness properties

(Designers have since modified the construction)

• We prove that much better attacks are impossible

Argon2: Winner of the recent Password Hashing Competition

- Simple design, likely will see wide adoption
- No proof of memory-hardness (in any model)
- Argon2i = variant with data-independent access pattern

Our Contributions

• We demonstrate a practical attack against Argon2i's memoryhardness properties

(Designers have since modified the construction)

- We prove that much better attacks are impossible
- \rightarrow Balloon has stronger proven security properties than Argon2i. (In practice…)

Henry Corrigan-Gibbs henrycg@stanford.edu

• Memory-hard password hashing functions increase the cost of offline dictionary attacks.

Henry Corrigan-Gibbs henrycg@stanford.edu

- Memory-hard password hashing functions increase the cost of offline dictionary attacks.
- Balloon is a password hashing function that:
	- has proven memory-hardness properties against sequential attacks,
	- uses a password-indep. access pattern, and
	- is fast enough for real-world use.

Henry Corrigan-Gibbs henrycg@stanford.edu

- Memory-hard password hashing functions increase the cost of offline dictionary attacks.
- Balloon is a password hashing function that:
	- has proven memory-hardness properties against sequential attacks,
	- uses a password-indep. access pattern, and
	- is fast enough for real-world use.
- Balloon+SHA512* **is strictly better** than iterated hashing (PBKDF2-SHA512).

Henry Corrigan-Gibbs henrycg@stanford.edu

- Memory-hard password hashing functions increase the cost of offline dictionary attacks.
- Balloon is a password hashing function that:
	- has proven memory-hardness properties against sequential attacks,
	- uses a password-indep. access pattern, and
	- is fast enough for real-world use.
- Balloon+SHA512* **is strictly better** than iterated hashing (PBKDF2-SHA512).

Henry Corrigan-Gibbs henrycg@stanford.edu

- Memory-hard password hashing functions increase the cost of offline dictionary attacks.
- Balloon is a password hashing function that:
	- has proven memory-hardness properties against sequential attacks,
	- uses a password-indep. access pattern, and
	- is fast enough for real-world use.
- Balloon+SHA512* **is strictly better** than iterated hashing (PBKDF2-SHA512).

Henry Corrigan-Gibbs henrycg@stanford.edu

An attacker who learns the memory access pattern of scrypt(passwd) can run a dictionary attack in *very little space*

scrypt(passwd)

An attacker who learns the memory access pattern of scrypt(passwd) can run a dictionary attack in *very little space*

0x0631

scrypt("12345")

An attacker who learns the memory access pattern of scrypt(passwd) can run a dictionary attack in *very little space*

P JL

